

Practical Status of Effective Educational Planning and Teachers' Performance in Nigeria

Abbas Sani Dahiru¹, Jibril Almustapha^{2*}

¹Federal University Gusau

²Zamfara State University Talata Mafara

Corresponding Author: Jibril Almustapha Jibrilalmustapha@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Status, Practical, Educational Planning, Teacher, Performance

Received : 3 January

Revised : 19 January

Accepted: 22 February

©2024 Dahiru, Almustapha : This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Atribusi 4.0 Internasional](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



ABSTRACT

This study aimed at assessing the status of effective educational planning and staff performance in some selected schools in Zamfara State, Nigeria. Two research questions were established to achieve the objectives of the study. A descriptive-survey research design was adopted. The population of the study consisted of all Public Secondary Schools in Gusau Metropolis of Zamfara State, having a total of 24 public secondary schools with 670 teachers. A total number of 12 public secondary schools and 225 in-service teachers were sampled to serve as participants in this study using simple random sampling technique. The sample size was determined using Morgan and Krejcie (1971) table of determining sample size. For the purpose of data collection, two (2) self-structured questionnaires were constructed on a 4-point Likert's Scale with 29 constructs. The data analysis was made using descriptive statistics and inferential statistics tools. The results revealed that, the status of effective educational planning in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent' with statistical value of ($M=4.56$, $SD=3.95$). Similarly, the status of staff performance in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent' with statistical value of ($M=3.69$, $SD=2.61$). Based findings, in order to maintain the high level of the effectiveness of educational planning in Nigeria, the Federal, State, and Local, and Governments as well as other relevant international and local organizations should put hands on deck in employing more professional planners and deploy them to the ministries and agencies for effective planning of education

INTRODUCTION

Education is considered the key to change and progress. It is an acquisition of knowledge and an effective developmental tool that fully supports the child. Education not only imparts knowledge and skills, but also instills values and promotes correct attitudes and habits. In other words, the goal of education is complete human development (Zamir, 2016). Planning as a concept refers to the process of applying scientific or rational procedures to the process of educational growth and development to ensure the efficiency and effectiveness of the educational system (Okunade, 2019). Ojunamiri et al. (2009) defined educational planning as a series of educational projects that ensure that educational objectives are properly realized in the future using available resources, namely human and material resources. This means that educational planning is aimed at ensuring the systematic implementation of a set of activities that lead to the achievement of established goals of educational development. According to the National Education Policy (1979), education planning is a system that obtains and analyzes facts and provides decision-makers with an empirically based understanding of how well the education system is achieving its objectives, particularly the cost-effectiveness of educational programmes. It is considered to be a continuous process that provides information to the It will be a specific project that can be improved. In Nigeria, educational planning aimed at improving growth & development, improving the intrinsic and extrinsic efficacy of the educational system(s), improving rational decision making, implementation of education policy (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2014). Planning is an important guiding document that is created specifically to accomplish specific activity tasks of an organization. In the context of education, planning is of paramount importance to achieve the country's set goals and educational philosophy. It is pertinent to mention here that planning is one of the key factors in the success of Nigeria's education sector. Similarly, employee performance in this study was viewed as the employee's efforts to meet the expectations of the employer in achieving the goals, mission, and vision of the organization or institution. In the education sector, the performance of staff plays an important role in the realization of the school's mission, which includes the implementation of curriculum content, the realization of Nigeria's educational philosophy, the creation of a better society and the improvement of Nigeria's socio-economic development.

On the other hand, ideally, performance is defined as "the degree of success in completing a task and the ability to achieve the intended objective (Gibson et al., 1985). Jewell & Siegal (1990) state that performance is the result of the extent to which organizational members perform their work to satisfy the organization. Staff performance is the extent to which individuals fulfill their responsibilities and duties (Singh et al., 1996). Gomes (1995) states that job performance is a record of the results resulting from a specific job or activity over a specific period of time. On the other hand, Colquitt et al. (2011) state that job performance is a set of employee behaviors that contribute to the achievement of organizational goals." Performance must be measurable. Gomes (1995) defined performance measurement as a way to measure an individual's level of contribution to an organization. Employee performance is generally positioned as a dependent variable in empirical research because it is viewed as an effect or

consequence of organizational behavior and human resource practices rather than as a cause or determinant. Furthermore, Gomes (1995) explained that there are two criteria for measuring employee performance, namely: 1. Outcome-based performance appraisal and 2. Performance appraisal. Behavior-based performance evaluation. Jewell & Siegal (1990) state that there are several factors that determine a person's performance: opportunity, ability, and motivation to perform." This opportunity includes tools, materials, supplies, working conditions, co-worker behavior, supervisor behavior, guidance, policies, regulations, organizational procedures, information, time, and compensation. Abilities consist of age, health, dexterity, intelligence, athletic ability, education level, stamina, stamina, and energy level. Performance is associated with motivation, job satisfaction, job status, anxiety, legitimacy, participation, attitude, recognition of job characteristics, work engagement, ego involvement, self-image, personality, norms, values, and roles.

LITERATURE REVIEW

One of the factors that can be evaluated is employee performance based on productivity. Several studies have introduced different methods to evaluate organizational performance (Wong & Wong, 2007; Prajogo, 2007). This includes the quality, quantity, knowledge, and creativity of an individual regarding the work performed in response to a period of responsibility. In other words, the rating system requires some standard parameters that are reliable. There are various factors that influence staff performance in the workplace. This study will focus on the following stakeholders related to the school environment: professional identity, self-efficacy, motivation, effective school leadership styles, employee engagement, professional involvement, productivity, organizational culture, job satisfaction, working environment as well as supervision (Lawal, 2021; Latham & Pinder, 2005; Colquitt et.al., 2011; Watetu, 2017; Shmailan, 2015; Summers & Hyman, 2005). In Nigeria, educational planning today faces many challenges and requires more sophisticated and better planning approaches to succeed. Some of these challenges concerned curriculum structure, implementation of decisions, leadership, and environmental regulations (Ogundele, 2014; Okon & Ebuara, 2015). There is no doubt that the development of the education sector in Zamfara State is declining due to non-adherence to the education planning documents in the state. Public schools in the state face numerous challenges, including dilapidated structures, dilapidated educational facilities, and poor educational management due to lack of viable and up-to-date educational planning documents. In Zamfara State, the performance of teachers in public secondary education is one of the major challenges to the proper development of education. Substandard performance of school teachers has a significant impact on teacher efficiency and therefore hinders the effective implementation of school activities as stipulated in the national education policy and other planning documents (Zamfara State Government, 2014).

Based on this review, we found that many research studies have been conducted regarding educational planning and teacher performance. However, there are little or no recent studies that have analyzed the relationship between effective educational planning and staff performance in school settings with

reference to Zamfara State. To address this gap, the present study aimed to analyze the status of effective educational planning and staff performance in some selected schools in Zamfara State, Nigeria.

Objectives of the Study

1. To assess the practical status of effective educational planning among public schools in Zamfara State.
2. To determine the practical status of teachers' performance among public schools in Zamfara State.

Research Questions

This study will be guided by the following research questions:

1. What is the Practical Status of effective educational planning among the schools in Zamfara State?
2. What is the Practical Status of teachers' performance among the schools in Zamfara State?

METHODOLOGY

This study adopted descriptive survey design. The study was plotted on survey design because it was in conformity with the characteristic of the survey research in finding out the extent of effectiveness of educational as well as the extent of the performance of the staff in a school setting. The population of the study consisted of all Public Secondary Schools in Gusau Metropolis of Zamfara State, having a total of 24 public secondary schools with 670 teachers. From the population of the study, a total number of 12 public secondary schools and 225 in-service teachers were sampled to serve as participants in this study using simple random sampling technique. The sample size was determined using Krejcie and Morgan (1971) table of determining sample size. For the purpose of data collection, two (2) self-structured questionnaires were constructed. First, "Effective Educational Planning Assessment Questionnaire (EEPAQ)" was employed to determine the level of effective educational planning. Second, "Staff Performance Evaluation Questionnaire (SPEQ)" was utilized in assessing the extent of teaching staff performance in the sampled public secondary schools. In order to analyse the relationship between effective educational planning and staff performance the constructs of the aforementioned questionnaires were merged together. The two instruments were structured on 4-point Likert's Scale, that is, 1. Strongly Disagree; 2. Disagree; 3. Agree; and 4. Strongly Agree, respectively. The research instruments were subjected to expert review by academics in the Faculty of Education, Federal University Gusau before embarking upon the data collection exercise. To ascertain the reliability of the instrument, a test re-test of the instrument was carried out amongst a small number of the respondents who are personnel among the sampled public secondary schools in Gusau Local Government Area, Zamfara State, Nigeria. The questionnaire instruments were distributed to the respondents with the help of a trained research assistant who helps in the distribution and immediate collection of the questionnaires in order to avoid missing or misplacement of the responses by the respondents.

The data analysis was made using descriptive statistics in analyzing the demographic data of the respondents using Frequency Distribution (F) and Simple Percentage (%); while, Mean (M) and Standard Deviation (S.D.) were

employed in determining the status of effective educational planning and that of staff performance.

RESULTS

Table 1. Mean Score Interpretation

Mean Scores Value	Status
1.00-2.33	Low
2.34-3.66	Moderate
3.67-5.00	High

Adopted from Dahiru and Almustapha (2022)

Research Question One: What is the practical status of effective educational planning among the schools in Zamfara State?

Table 2. Mean and Standard Deviation of the Constructs Related to the Status of Effective Educational Planning in Public Schools

Statements/Constructs	Mean	SD	Extent
EEP1 School administrators are professionally qualified and competent	3.79	3.29	High
EEP2 There is adequate organization and coordination of educational programs	3.80	3.29	High
EEP3 There is sufficient financial allocations for the execution of all educational programs and activities	3.80	3.31	High
EEP4 There is a provision of consistent engagement of school administrators, educational experts and staffs in the school activities	3.72	3.22	High
EEP5 There is a systematic formulation of educational goals and targets	3.74	3.25	High
EEP6 The activities are centralised on the proper implementation of curriculum contents	3.71	3.22	High
EEP7 There is always a systematic way of breakdown of curriculum contents of a specific subject to fit in the abilities of the learners	3.71	3.24	High
EEP8 "Planning for instructional objectives as required for the specific topic(s) to be taught in a subject are always adhered to".	3.91	3.38	High
EEP9 The educational planning documents explain the procedure(s) for selection and organization of learning activities	3.81	3.07	High
EEP10 "There is a prescribed techniques of selecting suitable and appropriate teaching aid(s) and its	3.88	3.36	High

usage as appropriate too in the course of lesson delivery”			
EEP11 “Selection of suitable evaluation techniques to find out the learning outcomes were also under the guide of the educational planning documents”	3.90	3.39	High
EEP12 There is a clearly stated rules and regulations governing the school activities	3.81	3.32	High
EEP13 Planning for socio-cultural activities and programmes is always adhered to.	3.36	2.88	Moderate
EEP14 There is a planning for sports and games	3.06	2.67	Moderate
EEP15 The planning also accommodates school-community relations	3.53	3.04	Moderate
EEP16 Work responsibilities of all staff members have been prescribed	3.72	3.25	High
Overall Mean Score of the Status of Effective Educational Planning in Public Schools	4.56	3.95	High

Table 2 presented above revealed that item EEP8 "Planning for instructional objectives as required for the specific topic(s) to be taught in a subject are always adhered to." had the highest mean score value ($M=3.91$, $SD=3.38$). Item EEP11 "Selection of suitable evaluation techniques to find out the learning outcomes were also under the guide of the educational planning documents." had the mean score ($M=3.90$, $SD=3.39$). Item EEP10 "There is a prescribed techniques of selecting suitable and appropriate teaching aid(s) and its usage as appropriate too in the course of lesson delivery" had the mean value ($M=3.88$, $SD=3.36$). Item EEP9 "The educational planning documents explain the procedure(s) for selection and organization of learning activities." obtained the mean ($M=3.81$, $SD=3.3$). Item EEP12 "There is a clearly stated rules and regulations governing the school activities" had ($M= 3.81$, $SD=3.32$). Item EEP2 "There is adequate organization and coordination of educational programs" obtained the mean value ($M=3.80$, $SD=3.29$). Item EEP3 "There is sufficient financial allocations for the execution of all educational programs and activities" ($M=3.80$, $SD=3.31$). Item EEP1 "School administrators are professionally qualified and competent" had ($M=3.79$, $SD=3.29$). Item EEP5 "There is a systematic formulation of educational goals and targets" had ($M=3.74$, $SD=3.25$). Item EEP16 "Work responsibilities of all staff members have been prescribed" had ($M=3.72$, $SD=3.25$). Item EEP4 "There is a provision of consistent

engagement of school administrators, educational experts and staffs in the school activities" had ($M=3.72$, $SD=3.22$). Item EEP6 "The activities are centralised on the proper implementation of curriculum contents" had ($M=3.71$, $SD=3.22$). Item EEP7 "There is always a systematic way of breakdown of curriculum contents of a specific subject to fit in the abilities of the learners" had ($M=3.71$, $SD=3.24$). Item EEP15 "The planning also accommodates school-community relations" had ($M=3.53$, $SD=3.04$). Item EEP13 "Planning for cultural activities and programmes" had ($M = 3.36$, $SD=2.88$). Finally, Item EEP14 "There is a planning for sports and games" had the lowest mean score value ($M=3.06$, $SD=2.67$).

The overall mean score of the status of the effectiveness of educational planning in the public schools was ($M=4.56$, $SD=3.95$). By referring to table 2 (Mean score interpretation) this implies that, the status of the effectiveness of educational planning in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'.

Research Question Two: What is the Practical Status of staff performance among the schools in Zamfara State?

Table 3. Mean and Standard Deviation of the Constructs Related to the Status of Staff Performance in Public Schools

Statements/Constructs	Mean	SD	Extent
SP1 I consider school as an organization for skills and professional development	3.71	3.23	High
SP2 I have a strong sense of "belonging" to my school as my working environment	3.70	3.21	High
SP3 I always participate in the curricular activities/programs are part of my fundamental professional responsibilities	3.84	3.33	High
SP4 I consistently participate in extra-curricular activities	3.53	3.04	Moderate
SP5 I always support the school administrators for improving the effectiveness of the school's management style	3.74	3.25	High
SP6 I have a high self-efficacy as a staff which helps me to perform my professional duties responsibly	3.71	3.21	High
SP7 I have a high level of job satisfaction which empowered me to perform well in carrying out my official engagements	3.68	3.22	High
SP8 A clear job responsibilities provided in the panning policy documents influences my level of productivity	3.88	3.36	High

SP9 "I can bear to take the responsibilities of converting scientific theories into physical practice/experimentation in my class instructions, for the academic achievement of my students"	3.86	3.36	High
SP10 "I owe a great deal to my school and my teaching profession in general"	3.75	3.24	High

Overall Mean Score of the Status of Staff Performance in Public Schools in Zamfara State

Source: Researcher's Field Survey, 2023; Note: SP = Staff Performance

Table 3 revealed that item SP8 "A clear job responsibilities provided in the panning policy documents influences my level of productivity" had the highest mean score ($M=3.88$, $SD=3.36$). Then item SP9 "I can bear to take the responsibilities of converting scientific theories into physical practice/experimentation in my class instructions, for the academic achievement of my students" ($M=3.86$, $SD=3.36$). Item SP3 "I always participate in the curricular activities/programs are part of my fundamental professional responsibilities" had ($M=3.84$, $SD=3.33$). Item SP10 "I owe a great deal to my school and my teaching profession in general" obtained ($M=3.75$, $SD=3.24$). Item SP5 "I always support the school administrators for improving the effectiveness of the school's management style" recorded ($M=3.74$, $SD=3.25$). Item SP1 "I consider school as an organization for skills and professional development" had ($M=3.71$, $SD=3.23$). Item SP6 "I have a high self-efficacy as a staff which helps me to perform my professional duties responsibly" had ($M=3.71$, $SD=3.21$). SP2 "I have a strong sense of "belonging" to my school as my working environment" observed ($M=3.70$, $SD=3.21$). Furthermore, item SP7 "I have a high level of job satisfaction which empowered me to perform well in carrying out my official engagements" obtained ($M=3.68$, $SD=3.22$). While item SP4 "I consistently participate in extra-curricular activities" had the lowest mean score value ($M=3.53$, $SD=3.04$).

The overall mean score of the status of staff performance in public schools was ($M=3.69$, $SD=2.61$). By referring to table 1 (Mean score interpretation) it implies that, the status of staff performance in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'.

DISCUSSION

The Status of Effectiveness of Educational Planning

The findings of this study discovered that, the status of the effective educational planning in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'. This finding is contrary to that of Edame (2015) who conducted a study educational planning as an instrument for national development in Nigeria and found that educational planning in Nigeria is below the average standard required for the proper takeoff of educational processes. Similarly, Mbai and Ugwulashi (2020) perceived in their study that, effective and proper educational planning is necessary in order to achieve educational goals and objectives in Nigeria. However, some factors such as lack of political-will and corruption led to the decline of the strategic educational planning in the country. Ebiziem et al (2021) conducted a study in establishing a relationship between strategic planning and educational sector performance in Nigeria. The findings of the study revealed that, the failure associated with education sector in Nigeria today is as a result of defective or lack of strategic planning which has given negative implications to the overall growth and development of education in the country. Ebiziem et al.'s study concluded that that strategic planning would enhance and strengthen efficiency and effectiveness in the development of the education sector. Furthermore, Gregory and Jegede (2021) conducted a research investigation titled "Educational Planning in Nigeria: Problems and the Ways Forward", the authors stressed that Educational planning is the key to achieving Nigeria's educational goals. In Nigeria, educational planning faces many challenges such as; For example, challenges to educational planning in Nigeria include lack of funding for planning, lack of educational planners, lack of data/information, lack of planning materials, political influence, political instability, and lack of capacity development for educational planners. Therefore, all the above factors influence the effectiveness of educational planning in Nigeria. Gregory and Jegede (2021) also suggest that to improve the effectiveness of educational planning, the following measures should be considered: increasing funding for educational planning, generating data, and training and retraining programs for educational planners to provide planning materials, hire more professional planners, ensure policy continuity, and ensure continuing education planning.

The Status of Staff Performance in Public Schools

Findings of this study revealed that, the status of staff performance in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'. This finding is in line with that of Olohundare et al. (2019) who dedicated in their study that teachers' performance is at great extent among Nigerian schools due to the fact that Job performance of teachers is very essential to actualizing the school goals.

This finding is also in accordance with that of Adejumobi and Ojikutu (2013) who investigated the school climate and teacher job performance in Lagos state, Nigeria and established that the extent of school staff performance was at a high extent among the public schools in Lagos State. However, Adejumobi and Ojikutu's differed from the current study as the former focused on Lagos State while the latter was conducted in Zamfara State.

In addition, this finding is in harmony with that of Akande (2014) who conducted a research investigation on the "Assessment of the Relationship between Conditions of Service and Teachers' Job Performance in Secondary Schools in Kogi State, Nigeria". Observed that the extent of teachers' performance among public secondary schools in Kogi state was at a great extent. Distinctively, Akande's work was conducted in Kogi State while the current study was conducted with special reference to Zamfara State, Nigeria.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings as summarized in chapter four, it can be concluded that:

1. The practical status of effective of educational planning in the public schools was Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'.
2. The practical status of staff performance in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'.

Based on the findings of the study the following recommendations are made:

- Government should initiate a timely assessment of the successful achievements of the provisions of educational planning policy documents review of educational planning policies. This would enable the government to determine and provide solutions to the challenges and constraints affecting the effectiveness of the country's educational planning for future or immediate improvement.
- In order to maintain the high level of the effectiveness of educational planning in Nigeria, the Federal, State, and Local, and Governments as well as other relevant international and local organizations should put hands on deck in employing more professional planners and deploy them to the ministries and agencies for effective planning of education.
- Furthermore, to enhance the status of the effectiveness of educational planning, the educational planning process in Nigeria must be future-oriented and goal-directed, based on the facts and not mere assumption.
- Stakeholders in the sector of education such as the government, educational policy-makers, school managers, leaders, and administrators, professional educational supervisors, should bring about new programs, in-service capacity building trainings and workshops aimed at enhancing the level of staff performance in the public schools.
- School administrators should endeavor to observe consistent assessment of the performance of their staffs in order to ensure that the status of staff performance is maintained as high as possible.

School staffs are recommended to put more effort in ensuring that they keep themselves in a position that would enable them to discharge their official responsibilities in accordance with the provisions of the educational planning policies of the country. Based on the findings as summarized in chapter four, it can be concluded that:

1. The practical status of effective of educational planning in the public schools was Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'.
2. The practical status of staff performance in public schools in Zamfara State was found at a 'High Extent'.

Based on the findings of the study the following recommendations are made:

- Government should initiate a timely assessment of the successful achievements of the provisions of educational planning policy documents review of educational planning policies. This would enable the government to determine and provide solutions to the challenges and constraints affecting the effectiveness of the country's educational planning for future or immediate improvement.
- In order to maintain the high level of the effectiveness of educational planning in Nigeria, the Federal, State, and Local, and Governments as well as other relevant international and local organizations should put hands on deck in employing more professional planners and deploy them to the ministries and agencies for effective planning of education.
- Furthermore, to enhance the status of the effectiveness of educational planning, the educational planning process in Nigeria must be future-oriented and goal-directed, based on the facts and not mere assumption.
- Stakeholders in the sector of education such as the government, educational policy-makers, school managers, leaders, and administrators, professional educational supervisors, should bring about new programs, in-service capacity building trainings and workshops aimed at enhancing the level of staff performance in the public schools.
- School administrators should endeavor to observe consistent assessment of the performance of their staffs in order to ensure that the status of staff performance is maintained as high as possible.

School staffs are recommended to put more effort in ensuring that they keep themselves in a position that would enable them to discharge their official responsibilities in accordance with the provisions of the educational planning policies of the country

FURTHER STUDY

Conceptually, this study focuses on the relationship between effective instructional planning and staff performance in school settings. Geographically, this study was conducted with reference to Zamfara State, Nigeria. Due to insecurity and financial constraints, this study is limited to some public secondary schools within Gusau local government area, which serves as the capital of Zamfara state, out of the 14 local government areas of Zamfara state.

1. This study was limited the target population only to public secondary school teachers in Gusau Local Government Area of Zamfara State. Therefore, the results may not be generalizable to populations outside the public secondary education system within and outside the state. Therefore, to gain more consistent and authentic insights into how effective educational planning and school staff performance are perceived by teachers, the context for future research should be across states in Nigeria and other states.
2. The level of staff performance was obtained through self ratings among the school personnel; future research works should assess the level of staff performance by school administrators.
3. This study uses a survey design that allows the researcher to collect a large sample at low cost and generalize the study results to the target population. Therefore, future researchers in this field are encouraged to implement qualitative research designs to explore respondents' feelings and thoughts

REFERENCES

Adejumobi, F.T. & Ojikutu, R.K. (2013). School climate and teacher job performance in Lagos state Nigeria. *Discourse Journal of Educational Research*, 1(2), 26-36.

Dahiru, A. S. & Almustapha, J. (2022). An Appraisal of the Degree of School Effectiveness among Secondary Schools of Zamfara State, Nigeria. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 1(3), 100-105.

Ebiziem, J.E., Ebere, N.N.I., & Izim, O.D. (2021). Strategic planning in the education sector in Nigeria: An appraisal. *Net Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(1), 1-10. <http://doi.org/10.30918/NJSS.91.20.026>

Edame, G.E. (2015). Planning as an Instrument for National Development in Nigeria. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research: B Economics and Commerce*, 15(4).

Federal Republic of Nigeria (2014). National policy on education. Lagos: NERDC.

Gibson, James L., John M. Ivancevich and James H. Donnelly, Jr. (1985). *Organization Behavior: Structure, Process*. Plano Texas: Business Publications Inc.

Gomes, F. Cardoso, (1995), *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia [Human Resource Management]*, 1st Edition, Yogyakarta : Andi Offset.

Gregory, D., & Jegede, D. (2021). Educational Planning in Nigeria: Problems and the Ways Forward. *Central Asian Journal Of Literature, Philosophy And Culture*, 2(2), 42-48.

Jewell & Siegall, M. (1990). Psikologi Industri Organisasi Modern [Modern Jurnal Profit, 12(1), <https://profit.ub.ac.id> 11 organization of industrial psychology]. Jakarta: Arcan.

Krejcie, R. & Morgan, W. (1971). Determining Sample Size for Research Activities. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, Vol. 30.

Lawal, A.H. (2021). The Relationship between Supervision and Teacher's Commitment in Public Secondary Schools of Gusau Local Government Area, Zamfara State. Unpublished M.Ed. Thesis, National Open University of Nigeria.

Okon, J., and Ebura, V.O. (2015). Strategic Plan and Implementation of Academic Programme in Unity Schools in South-South, Nigeria. *International Journal of Education and Research*, 3(8), 13-22.

Okunade, B. (2019). Introduction to Educational Planning. EME201 Course Manual, University of Ibadan Distance Learning Centre Open and Distance Learning.

Olohundare, S.K., Abubakar, L.A., Abdulkadir, A.T. & Musa, A.F. (2019). Teachers' Compensation As A Correlate Of Job Performance In Ilorin West Local Government Basic Schools, Kwara State. *Al-Hikmah Journal of Educational Management and Counselling*, 1(2), 51-61.

Prange, C., & Pinho, J. C. (2017). How personal and organizational drivers' impact on SME international performance: The mediating role of organizational innovation. *International Business Review*, 26(6), 1114-1123.

Shmailan, A.S.B. (2015). The relationship between job satisfaction, job performance and employee engagement: An explorative study. *Issues in Business Management and Economics*, 4(1), 1-8. <http://dx.doi.org/10.15739/IBME.16.001>

Singh, J., W. Verbeke & G.K. Rhoads (1996). Do Organizational Practices Matter in Role Stress Processes? A Study of Direct and Moderating Effects for Marketing-Oriented Boundary Spanners. *Journal of Marketing*, 60, 69-86.

Summers, J. and Hyman, J. (2005). Employee participation and company performance A review of the literature. Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Wong, W. P., & Wong, K. Y. (2007). Supply chain performance measurement system using DEA modeling. *Industrial Management and Data Systems*, 107(3), 361-81. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/02635570710734271>

Dahiru, Almustapha

Zamfara State Government (2017). Education Sector Medium Term Sector Strategy, unpublished official document of Zamfara State Ministry of Education.